

No.7

MONDAY 23 JULY, 2018
11.30 A.M.

11 30 AM

1. **QUESTIONS**

(1) **STARRED QUESTIONS**

Interruption by **Shri Chandrakant Kavalekar, Leader of Opposition** and 15 others Members on the Adjournment Motion date 20.7.218 on the same issue.

(a) **Questions Answered:-**

Starred Questions at Sl. Nos. 1A and 4B for the day were orally answered.

(b) **Reply Postponed:-**

Reply to Starred Questions Nos. 22B and 22C were postponed to next session.

(c) **Replies laid:-**

Replies to the rest of the Starred Questions were laid on the Table.

11 35 AM

RULING BY SPEAKER

I have received a notice of Adjournment Motion dated 20th July, 2018 under Rule 68 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business of the Goa Legislative Assembly from Shri Chandrakant Kavlekar and 15 other Members to discuss regarding the fish sold in Goa which has been found to be contaminated with the harmful chemical called formalin/formaldehyde to be taken before the Question hour. On this subject there is already a Calling Attention Notice by S/Shri Aleixo Reginaldo Lourenco and Nilesh Cabral, which has been received and the same has been moved in the House by Hon. Member Shri Nilesh Cabral on 19th July 2018 on which Hon. Chief Minister has made a Statement that he will reply on 23rd July 2018. Today therefore, Hon. Members will be having ample of time to discuss the same. As per Sub-Rule 6 of the Rule 70 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business of Goa Legislative Assembly, the Motion shall not anticipate the matter which has been previously fixed for the consideration. In such circumstance, such Motions are not normally admitted. If, the Member wants to censor the Government Business, there are ample opportunities are available to them to raise the issue through other means. Further, as per Rule 268 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business of the Goa Legislative Assembly the Motion is required to be disposed of by giving priority and I am therefore bound by this Rule. I would like to quote the Ruling of the Former Speaker Shri Shivraj Patel in the Lok Sabha in 1996-97 which was reproduced by Journal of Parliamentary Information in June 1996 volume 42- also as per the

Practice and Procedure of Parliament by Kaul & Shakhder Vith Edition page 533 which reads clearly, Adjournment Motions are normally not allowed during the Budget Discussion or during the discussion on the Motion of Thanks to the President's Address as the Members are having sufficient opportunity to focus the attention of the House to any matter during the discussion. I therefore disallow this Adjournment Motion.

11 45 AM

Pandemonium in the House.

11 50 AM

Opposition Members gathered in the Well of the House.

(2) UNSTARRED QUESTIONS

Replies Laid

Replies to Questions in Unstarred list (Corrected) were laid on the Table.

11 54 PM

2. PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

1. SHRI MANOHAR PARRIKAR, Chief Minister laid the Performance Budget 2018-19 in respect to the following Demands for Grants:

- (1) General Administration & Coordination (Demand No. 2).
- (2) Vigilance (Demand No. 22).
- (3) Information & Publicity (Demand No. 56).

2. SHRI MANOHAR PARRIKAR, Chief Minister laid the following Notifications/Orders/Annual Reports and Statement of Accounts of Economic Development Corporation:

- (i) 36th Annual Report for the year 2010 - 11.
- (ii) 37th Annual Report for the year 2011 - 12.
- (iii) 38th Annual Report for the year 2012 - 13.
- (iv) 39th Annual Report for the year 2013 - 14.
- (v) 40th Annual Report for the year 2014 - 15.
- (vi) 41st Annual Report for the year 2015 - 16.
- (vii) "Explanatory Memorandum" for the 2018 - 19.

Owing to continuous Pandemonium in the House Dr. Pramod Sawant, Speaker adjourned the House at 11 55 AM to meet at 12 30 PM.

12 30 PM

3. POSTPONED CALLING ATTENTION

S/SHRI ALEIXO R. LOURENCO AND NILESH CABRAL, MLAs had called the attention of the Minister for Health to the following on 19/7/2018:

"Fear and apprehension in the minds of Goans regarding the fish which is brought to be sold from outside the boundaries of Goa is laced with Formalin. Action the Government has taken to ensure that fish being the staple diet of Goa's local population which has to be free from this carcinogenic substance."

SHRI MANOHAR PARRIKAR, Chief Minister made a Statement in regard thereto.

The following Members sought clarifications.

1. Shri Nilesh Cabral, MLA.....12 44 PM.
2. Shri Aleixo R. Lourenco, MLA.....12 55 PM.

(House adjourned for lunch at 1 00 PM and resumed it sitting at 2 30 PM)

2 30 PM

3. Shri Aleixo R. Lourenco, MLA.....2 30 PM
4. Shri Churchill Alemao, MLA.....2 35 PM
5. Shri Luizinho Faleiro, MLA.....2 46 PM
6. Smt. Jennifer Monserrate, MLA.....2 58 PM
7. Shri Filipe Nery Rodrigues, MLA.....3 01 PM
8. Shri Isidore Fernandes, MLA.....3 08 PM
9. **Shri Michael Lobo, Dy. Speaker**.....3 11 PM
10. Shri Antonio Fernandes, MLA.....3 15 PM
11. Smt Alina Saldanha, MLA.....3 18 PM
12. Shri Digambar Kamat, MLA.....3 23 PM
13. Shri Clafasio Dias, MLA.....3 25 PM
14. Shri Pratapsingh R. Rane, MLA.....3 27 PM
15. Shri Rajesh Patnekar, MLA.....3 28 PM
16. Shri Francis Silveira, MLA.....3 30 PM
17. Shri Nilkanth Halarnkar, MLA.....3 35 PM
18. Shri Dayanand Sopte, MLA.....3 39 PM
19. Shri Wilfred D'Sa, MLA.....3 43 PM
20. Shri Glenn Ticlo, MLA.....3 45 PM
21. Shri Prasad Gaonkar, MLA.....3 47 PM
22. **Shri Chandrakant Kavalekar, Leader of Opposition...**
.....3 48 PM
23. **Shri Manohar Parrikar, Chief Minister**.....3 55 PM

4 00 PM

4. DISCUSSION AND VOTING OF THE FOLLOWING DEMANDS FOR GRANTS,2018-19(DAY-1)

SHRI MANOHAR PARRIKAR, Chief Minister moved the following:

- | | | |
|---------------|---|---------------------------------------|
| Demand No. 2 | - | General Administration & Coordination |
| Demand No. 14 | - | Goa Sadan |

Demand No. 17	-	Police
Demand No. 18	-	Jails
Demand No. 22	-	Vigilance
Demand No. 23	-	Home
Demand No. 24	-	Environment
Demand No. 25	-	Home Guards & Civil Defence
Demand No. 26	-	Fire & Emergency Services
Demand No. 27	-	Official Language
Demand No. 29	-	Public Grievances
Demand No. 56	-	Information and Publicity
Demand No. 69	-	Handicraft, Textile and Coir
Demand No. 75	-	Planning, Statistics & Evaluation
Demand No. 79	-	Goa Gazetteer
Demand No. 84	-	Airport

Cut Motions tabled by **S/Shri Chandrakant Kavalekar (Leader of Opposition) Pratapsingh R. Rane, Filipe Nery Rodrigues, Isidore Fernandes , Antonio Fernandes and Smt. Jennifer Monserrate, MLAs** were moved to Demand Nos. 2, 17, 22, 24, 25, 26, 29, 56, 69, 79 and 84.

The following Members took part in the Debate:

1. Shri Digambar Kamat, MLA.....4 15 PM

(Shri Michael Lobo, Dy. Speaker in Chair at....4 16 PM)

2. Shri Filipe Nery Rodrigues, MLA.....4 30 PM

3. Shri Dayanand Sopte, MLA.....4 45 PM

4. Shri Nilkanth Halarnkar, MLA.....5 00 PM

(Dr. Pramod Sawant, Speaker in Chair at.....5 03 PM)

5. **Shri Michael Lobo, Dy. Speaker**.....5 13 PM

6. Shri Pratapsingh R. Rane, MLA.....5 26 PM

7. Shri Churchill Alemao, MLA.....5 31 PM

8. Shri Aleixo R. Lourenco, MLA.....5 43 PM

OBSERVATION BY HON'BLE SPEAKER

“Regarding the naming I am quoting an observation which is referred by the then Speaker on 13th July 1999. The Member should not name the person who cannot defend themselves. The then Speaker had given an observation, you have referred a person particularly an Officer who is not present in the House, you have said the Vigilance Officer. Don't name anybody. I don't

want anybody to be named particularly those who are not present in the house.”

9. Shri Clafasio Dias, MLA.....5 57 PM
10. Shri Rajesh Patnekar, MLA.....6 03 PM
11. Shri Nilesh Cabral, MLA.....6 22 PM
12. Shri Prasad Gaonkar, MLA.....6 20 PM

Shri Nilesh Cabral, MLA in Chair at.....6 22 PM

13. Shri Glenn Ticlo, MLA.....6 24 PM
14. Shri Pravin Zantye, MLA.....6 30 PM
15. Shri Francis Silvera, MLA.....6 33 PM
16. Shri Wilfred D'Sa, MLA.....6 39 PM
17. Smt. Alina Saldanha, MLA.....6 43 PM
18. Shri Deepak Prabhu Pauskar, MLA.....6 49 PM

(Dr. Pramod Sawant, Speaker in Chair at.....5 03 PM)

19. Shri Chandrakant Kavalekar, Leader of Opposition6 52 PM

7 0 4 PM

SHRI MANOHAR PARRIKAR, Chief Minister replied to the Debate.

Cut Motions to Demand No. 2 at Sl. Nos. 1 to 4 of list Nos. 1 circulated separately was put to vote and negated.

Cut Motions to Demand No. 17 at Sl. Nos. 1 to 8 of list Nos. 1 circulated separately were put to vote and negated.

Cut Motions to Demand No. 22 at Sl. Nos. 1 and 2 of list Nos. 1 circulated separately was put to vote and negated.

Cut Motions to Demand No. 24 at Sl. Nos. 1 to 6 of list Nos. 1 circulated separately was put to vote and negated.

Cut Motion to Demand No. 25 of list No. 1 circulated separately was put to vote and negated.

Cut Motions to Demand No. 26 at Sl. Nos. 1 to 5 of list No. 1 circulated separately was put to vote and negated.

Cut Motions to Demand No. 29 at Sl. Nos. 1 to 3 of list No. 1 circulated separately was put to vote and negated.

Cut Motion to Demand No. 56 of list No. 1 circulated separately was put to vote and negatived.

Cut Motions to Demand No. 69 at Sl. Nos. 1 to 4 of list No. 1 circulated separately was put to vote and negatived.

Cut Motion to Demand No. 79 of list No. 1 circulated separately was put to vote and negatived.

Cut Motions to Demand No. 84 at Sl. Nos. 1 to 12 of list No. 1 circulated separately was put to vote and negatived.

Demand Nos. 2, 14,17, 18, 22, 23, 24, 25, 26, 27, 29, 56, 69, 75, 79and 84 were put to vote and passed.

(HOUSE ADJOURNED AT 7 31 PM TO MEET AT 11 30 AM ON TUESDAY THE 24 JULY 2018)

**ASSEMBLY HALL
PORVORIM-GOA
23 JULY, 2018.**

**N. B. SUBHEDAR
SECRETARY**